BUILDING CITIZENS

A Critical Reflection & Discussion Guide
For Community Service Participants

Walt Whitman Center For The Culture And Politics Of Democracy

270 GC SHE 1998
BUILDING CITIZENS

A Critical Reflection and Discussion Guide For Community Service Participants

Written and Edited by Margo Shea and Kevin Mattson

Designed by Margo Shea
Cover Design by José Hernandez

A Project of:
The Walt Whitman Center for the Culture and Politics of Democracy
Rutgers University
89 George Street
New Brunswick, New Jersey 08901-1411
phone: (732) 932-6861
fax: (732) 932-1922

NSLC
c/o ETR Associates
4 Carbonero Way
Scotts Valley, CA 95066

AT 36141
thank you
Many hands make light work and we'd like to thank all of those who, through their knowledge, experience and generosity, made this a delightful endeavor.

To those who read and edited drafts, asked questions and contributed many ideas and suggestions that helped to shape and define the manual:

MELISSA BASS, RICK BATTISTONI, HARRY BOYTE AND STEPHANIE OLSON

To those who contributed games, exercises, readings and critical incidents and who also shared with us their own experiences in facilitating and encouraging critical reflection:

AmeriCorps’ Community Action Corps of Newark, NJ, The Center for Democracy and Citizenship at the Humphrey Institute of Public Affairs, the Close Up Foundation, The Massachusetts Commission for National and Community Service, Penn Scott Paper Summer Interns ’97, Youth Service New Jersey, Diane Allton, Karen Booth (Ramapo College), Ron Davis (formerly of the Highlander Research and Education Center), Claudia Horwitz (Stone Circles), Leif Elsmo (Chicago Public Allies), Bertram Eyakuze, Nancie Koenigsberg, Yvette Murry (Rutgers University), Joan O’Brien, Melissa Smith, Greg White and the many other people with whom we spoke who helped us to build and strengthen the connections between reflection, service and citizenship.

To everyone at Public Allies, particularly Public Allies Delaware, for enabling us to learn with you and from you through our many conversations and discussions about service, citizenship and reflection.

Special thanks to the Walter and Elise Haas Fund, Bruce Sievers and Pat Mattox for making this project possible.

thank you
"Building Citizens" is a collaboration of the Walt Whitman Center for the Culture and Politics of Democracy and the Walter and Elise Haas Fund. This project is rooted in our belief at the Whitman Center that democracy is as much a way of life as a form of government, and that it must be served jointly by thought and action, by deliberation and commitment. "Building Citizens" was written to help community service programs to incorporate a deliberative, civic dimension into their programs.

Education-centered service has come to mean service that is directly linked to schools, colleges and universities. However, reflective service — service that combines community involvement and structured, critical reflection — can and should be the rule rather than the exception in all service programs. But making it work is not always easy. Even when groups want to incorporate reflective, critical and scholarly elements into their agendas, they are hard pressed to do so. Too often, we see instead front-loaded training sessions and episodic reflection which offer little opportunity for critical self-examination or group deliberation.

"Building Citizens" will guide community service programs and participants in reflection that makes explicit connections between service and critical, enlivened citizenship. This practical guide will, we hope, allow any group to begin the critical process. Used well, it can expand the horizons of a group's thinking as well as the boundaries of their service experiences for the immediate benefit of our communities and the sustained vigor of our democracy.

Benjamin R. Barber
Director
Walt Whitman Center
January 1998
This guide contains few, if any, original ideas. Our suggestions for building a critical, reflective group process for community service participants draw heavily from the ideas of experiential educators, political theorists and other scholars, service program directors, activists and others.

In particular, we have drawn heavily from the following reference manuals, books and educational organizations:

**Manuals**


By the People: An AmeriCorps Citizenship and Service Guide; *Sponsored by the Minnesota Commission on National and Community Service and The Center for Democracy and Public Life at the Humphrey Institute of Public Affairs*, 1995

Humphrey Institute University of Minnesota 301 - 19th Avenue South, Minneapolis, MN, 55455 (612) 625-9505


Reinventing Citizenship: The Practice of Public Work *Staff and Partners of the Center for Democracy and Public Life at the Humphrey Institute for Public Affairs*, 1995, Minneapolis University of Minnesota (same as above)
Books

Frank Adams Unearthing the Seeds of Fire: The Idea of Highlander (with Myles Horton), 1975, Winston-Salem, John Blair, Publisher

John Dewey Democracy and Education 1916, New York, Macmillan


Janice Kendall and Associates Combining Service and Learning: A Resource Book for Community and Public Service / A Publication of the National Society for Internships and Experiential Education (now National Society of Experiential Educators) 1990, Raleigh NSEE 3509 Haworth Drive, Suite 207 Raleigh, NC 27609

Morris Keeton and Pamela Tate, editors Learning By Experience; What, Why and How, New Directions in Experiential Learning, #1, 1978 1978, San Francisco, Josey-Bass

Patricia and Richard Schmuck Group Processes in the Classroom 1971, 1975, 1979, Dubuque, William C. Brown and Company


Organizations

American Field Service
Highlander Research and Education Center
The Maine Campus Compact
The Center for Democracy and Public Life at the Humphrey Institute for Public Affairs
# Table of Contents

## Introduction: General Orientation

- Why This Guide? ............................................. 2
- Before Getting Started .................................. 8
- Sample “Courses of Study” ............................... 11

## Part One: Common Thinking: From Me to We

- From Me to We in a Democracy ...................... 19
- Suggestions for Facilitation: Part One .............. 23
- Starting With Ourselves: Individual Reflection Exercises .............................. 24
- Learning to Listen: Exercises to Improve Listening Skills ............................ 31
- Why Talk is Important: Communication Exercises .................................... 38
- Problem Solving Exercises .................................. 51
- Other Exercises: Intros and Icebreakers ................................................ 57

## Part Two: Critical Thinking: From Narrative to Analysis

- What Does It Mean to Move from Narrative to Analysis? ......................... 69
- Facilitation Guide ........................................ 75
  - General Responsibilities of the Facilitator ........................................ 77
  - Verbal Tools for Effective Discussions .......................................... 82
  - The Flipside: Verbal Tendencies that Block Good Discussions ............... 85
  - How to Solve Common Problems in Group Discussions ....................... 87
  - Setting Guidelines for Group Discussions ..................................... 89

- Notes on Experiential Learning and Community Service ......................... 95
  - Learning Through Community Service ........................................ 97
  - Traditions of Informal Community Education .................................. 98

- Relating Experiential and Democratic Learning to Community Service .... 100
  - Dewey’s Theories on Democracy and Experiential Learning ................ 102
  - The Learning Cycle: How Experience Teaches Us ................................ 104
  - Different Kinds of Intelligence .................................................... 105

- Service-Learning .......................................... 110
  - Incorporating Service-Learning Concepts into Your Program ............... 111
Learning Exercises 113

Critical Incidents 126
Different Expectations 130
First Day at Residence for People with HIV/AIDS 132
Keeping Things Under Control 134
Discomfort at the Service Site 136
Accountability: Where is Your Supervisor 138
Accountability’s Flip Side: Where are the Other Volunteers? 140
Unexpected Resources 142
Who’s In Charge? 144
How Do People See You at the Service Site? 146
More Than a Museum Piece 150
Practicing What You Preach 152
Different Notions of Public Safety 154
Creating Your Own Critical Incidents 156

Community Mapping 157
Community Asset Mapping 161
Practicing Mapping 165
Practicing Community Asset Mapping 168

Different Models of Service To Think About 169
Religion and the Motivation to Serve 171
Charity/Philanthropy 173
Professional Social Work 174
Democratic Community Organizing 175
Service as Democratic Citizenship 176
Group Discussion on Motivations 177
Examining Conflicts Between Motivations 178

Is Your Service Democratic? Take the Test and See 180

PART THREE: COMPLEX THINKING
SERVICE IN A BROADER CONTEXT 183

Service in a Broader Context 184
Suggestions for Facilitation: Part Three 187
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It Got Them Thinking: Reflections By Young People on Service</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecting</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aide for AIDS</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toward a New Environmentalism</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living in the Spirit of SHAC</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King of the Hill</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starting a Community Service Organization</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Year</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing Exercise: Reflecting on Service</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Voyages</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jane Addams</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jimmy Carter</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Lou Wolff</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.P. Ellis</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kean, et al</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myles Horton</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is Contested</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is a Learning Opportunity</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Service Work - Robert Coles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is Moral /Service is Immoral</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Hell With Good Intentions - Ivan Illich</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Moral Equivalent of War - William James</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is Altruism/Altruism is Slavery</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Being a Good Neighbor - Martin Luther King, Jr.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excerpt from the Fountainhead - Ayn Rand</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Creates Democratic Communities/Service Destroys Community</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Cooperation - Jane Addams</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Enemy of Community - James McKnight</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is Charity/Service is a Profession</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charity - Maya Angelou</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why Do We Remain Silent - Corrine McKinney</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service is Therapeutic/Empowering or Destructive?</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Statistics to Soup Kitchens - Victoria Jueds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Service and Civic Education - Harry Boyte</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danny - Trabian Shorters</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Service is Citizenship/Citizenship Won’t Be Taught Through Service*
- Mandate for Liberty: Benjamin Barber
- Public Service or Else - Scott Bullock

Service and the Nation: The Politics of National and Community Service

*How We Define Service and How Service Defines Us as a Nation*
- The How and Why of Volunteering - Benjamin Barber
- Why Service Matters - Colin Powell
- Two Cheers for Charity - Mario Cuomo

*How Shall We Respond to National Service?*
- National Debt, National Service - William F. Buckley
- Politics and National Service - A Virus Attacks the Volunteer Sector - B. Chapman
- The Implications of National Service on Youth and Communities - Claudia Horwitz

*AmeriCorps - How it Fits into the Debate*
- Don’t Call Them Volunteers - John Walters
- A New Bargain for National Service - Sam Nunn

**CONCLUSION: BEING AN ACTIVE CITIZEN**